

The Live Concert as an Inherent Part of School Music Curricula?¹

DOCHY LICHTENSZTAJN

...Since music is a language with some meaning at least for the immense majority of mankind, although only a tiny minority of people are capable of formulating a meaning in it, and since it is the only language with the contradictory attributes of being at once intelligible and untranslatable, the musical creator is a being comparable to the gods, and music itself the supreme mystery of the science of man, a mystery that all the various disciplines come up against and which holds the key to their progress.²

Introduction

The music performed in a concert is an abstract reality that immediately touches the young listener's emotions, but at the same time, obligates them to metaphoric constructions, originating in their own cultural context, as well as their psycho-physiological experience (Lichtensztajn, 2006). That being the case, the young listener's extent of pleasure during a concert depends on activating their cognitive-affective faculties, thus creating a continuum of meanings and interpretations of the musical information heard. If the live music performance ensures the experience of discovering, understanding, reflection, and emotional pleasure, the desired expectation toward the next concert may result. The preparation process is, naturally, a fundamental component. However, my sense that a "live" concert is needed to achieve this goal deserves deeper inquiry.

How to create a sense of necessity and anticipation of the classic live concert?

...It is necessary to understand why a madrigal by Gesualdo or a Bach Passion, a sitar melody from India or a song from Africa, Berg's *Wozzeck* or Britten's *War Requiem*, a Balinese gamelan or a Cantonese opera, or a symphony by Mozart, Beethoven, or Mahler, may be profoundly necessary for human survival...³

The spell that John Blacking casts on us is an expression of the unsatisfied lust for our world; an unwillingness to shape it, despite the need to examine human mental habits, understand the way people act and think; and reexamine regulations and institutions.⁴

¹ The inspiration for this paper comes from my personal experiences during almost 35 years in the field of "live" concerts, my previous written works, and from qualitative and quantitative studies and research on the activities of the Israel Philharmonic Orchestra's Keynote Program for Music Education and Community Outreach. While writing this essay, I was constantly aware of the image and character of Judith Cohen, who supported me and encouraged my work, from my nomination as Pedagogical Director of Concert Programs for the Whole Family (performed by the Shiruli Vocal and Instrumental Ensemble), and later on, for educational institutions performed by leading orchestras in Israel by the Israel Philharmonic Keynote Program, the *Meitarim* [Strings] Program with the Tel Aviv Soloists Orchestra, the *Kadma* program with the Haifa Symphony, and the Elhan Program with the Galilee Chamber Orchestra, established by the Polyphony Foundation, that aims to bridge the divide between Arab and Jewish communities in Israel through music.

² Claude Lévi-Strauss, *The Raw and The Cooked: Introduction to the science of Mythology—1*, translated by John and Doreen Weightman, (New York: Harper & Row, 1969), p. 18.

³ John Blacking, *How Musical is Man?* (Seattle: University of Washington Press, 1973), 116.

⁴ Dochy Lichtensztajn, "The 'Live' Concert, a Transient Episode or a Continuous Educational Event in a Multi-Culturally Divided Society?" in *Creating Partnerships, Making Links, and Promoting Change:*

Forty-six years separate between his vision and the global village phenomenon. The latter blurs any particular cultural foundation shared by areas, peoples, and beliefs; and questions the power of the masterpieces he mentioned to become vital objects.

Applying this concept to Israel's specific situation, the question is: "Will Israeli children who, on one hand, culturally belong to the global village, but on the other, are divided by status, ethnic-traditional background, and national divisions, *need* Mozart's, Beethoven's, or Berg's compositions; an East-Mediterranean tune; a Ladino romance; a Yiddish lullaby; or Thelonious Monk's improvisations, like fresh air? I doubt it.

It is not only the canonic musical repertoire that is missing from most children's everyday reality, but it seems that the very experience of music as art has no practical function in their lives. The need for such involvement, therefore, depends on regular and multidimensional encounters at school. The wish for a musical artwork, performed in a live classical concert, for example, is not even present in most of our children's communities. The "live" Western-music concert is a culturally acquired phenomenon that requires intellectual skill: deciphering, learning and preparation. Sadly, it does not seem to be a primary objective of our music education programs. Many generations of students have gone through 12 years of school and taken their matriculation exams, without ever having set foot in a classical music concert hall, beside a rock or folk concerts.

Until the twenty-first century, teachers and principals labeled Western classical music as "elitist," aimed only for a predominantly white, middle class, economically comfortable, cultured and educated demographic. Among those characteristics, first and foremost, was the relatively high economic status. Even though attending a football [soccer] game is expensive, as are rock performances and festivals, no one suggests that these activities are "elitist."⁵

General teachers claim that classical music concerts are dramatically different from popular musical concerts; in the former, the music is presented without explanation or even introduction, since it is assumed that an appreciation of classical music is part of the lifestyle of the middle-class audience.⁶ The concert hall is kept free of visual distractions, and the performers are dressed conservatively, so as not to divert the audience's attention. The audience is expected to sit in silence, respectfully watching mostly anonymous performers, while keeping their attention focused solely on the music. And finally, and most importantly—the audience is expected to silently observe the performers.⁷ On the other hand, recent research on Western live concert music in schools finds a positive influence on young listeners:

...the concert makes them free of daily routine, helps them forget sorrow, overcome anger and cope with stress. Some students thought that music helps them socialize, and relaxes them. For the students, attending classical concerts was "... pleasant and enjoyable interesting and unforgettable...exciting and relaxing..." only if attending classical concerts is regular and frequent.⁸

Proceedings from the 2006 ISME Seminar of the Commission for Community Music Activity, edited by Don Coffman and Lee Higgins, (Singapore: National Institute of Education, Singapore, 2006), 111–21.

⁵ Frances Wilson ("The Cross-Eyed Pianist"), "[Negative Perceptions of Classical Music: Who made Classical Music 'elitist'?](#)" Blog, July 24th 2019, accessed December 7, 2022.

⁶ Nick Prior, "[Bourdieu and the Sociology of Music Consumption: A Critical Assessment of Recent Developments](#)," *Sociology Compass* 7, no. 3 (2013): 181–93, accessed December 7, 2022.

⁷ Bonita M. Kolb, "[You Call This Fun? Reactions of Young First-time Attendees to a Classical Concert](#)," *MEIEA Journal* 1 no.1 (2000): 13–28, accessed December 7, 2022.

⁸ Milena Petrović, Sabina Vidulin, and Gabriela Karin Konkol, "Benefits of Classical Concerts on Students' Wellbeing: Results from the European Research Project," *Performing Together in*

These last conditions, frequent and regular attendance, coincide with Pierre Bourdieu's *habitus* as a motivating, cognitive structure which orients perception and subsequently expresses itself in all the domains of life, "in ways of walking, in ways of talking, in bodily habits, in aesthetic preferences; that is, *in ways of being*."⁹ This process typically begins in the family setting, and is later consolidated through other agencies, such as schools, but also social media peer groups.

While Bourdieu defines *habitus* as an interest of the socio-cultural class that appropriates the classical music concert as a manifestation of its elitist power in social and cultural capital, I, however, am interested in adopting the *habitus* as a phenomenon that makes the Western artistic corpus not only accessible but also attractive to students from diverse backgrounds. The students are introduced to this world of classical concert music, learn and get comfortable with its characteristics, and to other channels of musical practices, too. This approach aligns with the writings of the renowned ethnomusicologist, Bruno Nettl: "...music is not the universal language of mankind, but rather, a group of discrete languages, or perhaps better stated, systems of communication, each integrated and unified, and each of them must be learned."¹⁰

How is it possible, then, to re-construct the *habitus* in a way that students become curious, and eagerly anticipate attending a live classical music concert? And, can that be done even though the music is not considered a *required* subject in the general curriculum of the Israeli Ministry of Education?

Bourdieu's *habitus* and its manifestations in the Spanish *Cultural Albacete* case

In his literature review, Robert Manley relies on numerous studies showing that the audience for classical music has significantly and consistently aged since the 1930s. In 2008, the USA median age of audiences at classical concerts was 49; while in Australia the age group of most attendees was 65-74, a tendency that is creating a decreasing niche-audience.¹¹

A categorically different phenomenon, however, can be seen in a series of events that occurred in 1983, in the town of Albacete, in Castilla-La Mancha, Spain. Following the long years of Franco's dictatorship, like many other small cities, Albacete, with its 120,000 inhabitants, was characterized as a sealed settlement, with no access to the wide array of remarkably high-quality artistic performances, which are usually accessible in large cities. The first decade of Felipe Gonzalez's democratic-socialistic government, established in 1982, had a focus on educational and cultural initiatives in vast regions of Spain. The declared aspiration was to lead Spain back to the level of contemporary European culture while setting high-standards for performers. The Juan March Foundation for Culture and Education chose Albacete as the site of a comprehensive project, to study the question of expanding the aesthetics horizons of a significant number of its citizens through a substantial number of

Education: Thematic Proceedings, edited by Milena Petrović, (Belgrade: Faculty of Music, 2020) 86–97.

⁹ Stijn Daenekindt, "[Cultural Taste and Social Mobility](#)," Ph.D. Dissertation, Department of Sociology, (Ghent, Belgium: Ghent University, 2015), p. 5, accessed December 7, 2022, emphasis in the original.

¹⁰ Bruno Nettl, "Music Education and Ethnomusicology: a (usually) Harmonious Relationship," *Min-Ad: Israel Studies in Musicology Online* 8 no. 1 (2010). The article is largely based on a keynote address given at the 29th meeting of the International Society for Music Education (ISME), on August 3rd, 2010, in Beijing, China.

¹¹ Robert James Manly, "Developing and sustaining audience participation for classical music in a regional Australian community: Facilitators and constraints of engagement," Ph.D. Thesis, The University of Queensland, p. 7.

performances by top quality artists. Would there be a significant rise of response and of demand for continued performances in the long run?¹²

The *Cultural Albacete* project was launched, and the town's citizens were granted an intensive and varied program of concerts, operas, ballet and theater. Later on, cultural centers, a literary salon, and a museum were opened. Mondays were designated as the day for symphonic and chamber music concerts. The new cultural scenario, in which Albacete's citizens were granted access to a chamber music performance or a symphonic orchestra every Monday took shape, to the astonishment of the researchers who found it hard to explain.¹³

The Question of Taste

The issue of taste and preferences in music has been dealt with by the prominent sociologist Antoine Hennion. In his discussion of the subject, he proposes that musical taste is not a property available for inspection as an object, but rather an activity: music is a dynamic set of engagements that have sensuous, physiological components, which unfold from moment to moment.¹⁴ Hennion negates Bourdieu's approach that reinforces the phenomena of taste and preference based on the concept of Distinction;¹⁵ in fact, he objects to the very idea of Distinction having a role in music listening. To him, taste is rooted not so much in a sociology of distinction, as it is a phenomenology of dedication, wherein "it is music as a ceremony of pleasure, a series of little habits and ways of doing things in a situation, depending on each one's preferences, sets of routines and of arrangements and surprises."¹⁶

The policy of *focusing* on the arts, and especially on music, that is, on the controversial cultural boom, which was at the foundation of the *Cultural Albacete* project, precluded a short-term perspective.

The project was based on three principles:

1. Excellent performance levels;
2. High frequency (weekly) and quantity of artistic events; and
3. Long-term planning (for the years 1983–1999) to ensure a sense of familiarity with the classical performances.

Did a "hunger" for concerts arise amongst the town citizens? That is unclear. Nonetheless, an appetite for live concerts, and motivation to attend them, were indeed nurtured and strongly felt. Until the end of the twentieth century orchestras, chamber music ensembles, operatic and theatrical productions, all of the highest quality, appeared in Albacete; they came from Paris, the Czech Republic, from Madrid and Barcelona, from London and Russia. Moreover, Albacete has established its own local performing ensembles, which are supported by the project itself as part of the annual artistic performances.¹⁷

¹² For an extensive study on evaluation criteria for socio-cultural programs, see Maria-José Aguilar-Ibáñez and Ezequiel Ander-Egg, [Evaluación de servicios y programas sociales](#), (Buenos Aires: Lumen, 1994), accessed December 7, 2022.

¹³ "Barreda: 'La transformación económica y social de Albacete es un paradigma para Castilla-La Mancha'," *La Cerca*, December 1, 2003, accessed December 4, 2022.

¹⁴ Antoine Hennion, "Music Lovers: Taste as Performance," *Theory, Culture, Society*, 2001, 18, no. 5, pp. 1–22, accessed December 5, 2022. See p. 3.

¹⁵ Pierre Bourdieu, *Distinction, A Social Critique of the Judgment of Taste*, translated by Richard Nice, (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1984).

¹⁶ Hennion, "Music Lovers..." p. 16.

¹⁷ Ana Fe Serra, Interview with José López Ariza: "[La cultura es libertad sobre todo](#)," *La Cerca*, Diario electrónico de Albacete, 1-7, June 10, 2021, accessed December 5, 2022.

Albacete's residents were involved, that is, they were internalizing the habit of listening to and watching live classical music concerts and performances, as the result of restructuring the experience. That is to say, the educational act is a continuous process of growth; at any given stage, it aims at additional growth.¹⁸

Undoubtedly, when this process is fully utilized through a categorical imperative, it may offer its citizens an array of growth possibilities, while promoting society's collective and particular ideals. Following it may realize, for example, John Blacking's vision, when inalienable assets, such as different musical cultures, are taught, not only as part of the school curriculum, by listening to recorded music, but even more so in a live performance, where the music is newly interpreted by its own reconstruction.

Albacete's experiment was reflected upon 15–20 years later, and the project has become the object of discussion by many communities. José Manuel Martínez, writer and literary critic, who was in charge of communications, publications and conferences of the Cultural Albacete's program, looks back at the grappling that started in the mid-1990s with populist trends based on supply and demand in the city, primarily due to its proximity to Madrid, and the typical culture and arts of the lively capital city.¹⁹

The question must now be asked, if fulfillment of the Albacete experiment's long-term objectives, with an excellent level of musical artists in frequent concerts over a period of years, is indeed the right formula to turn the live classical music concert into an integral part of the curriculum in schools. The following statement, said by a young rocker in a conversation with another young rocker, implies that there is a chance that adolescents' sensory and cognitive "backpacks" could be opened up, developed, and expanded:

"You keep loving but what you have been" [...] your tastes are your past in sediment (family, school, social...), it forms your identity. [...] If the rocker in question makes this reflection to his partner, it is because he also thinks that tastes are negotiated in the exchange with others.²⁰

A review of the didactic "Live Concert" models for young listeners²¹

Leonard Bernstein's impressive breakthrough with the New York Philharmonic's 1950s youth concerts is etched in our consciousness. Bernstein improved the didactic concert models in terms of the *Art of Teaching*. Concerts with a moderator holding a microphone, lecturing or "teaching a lesson" and invoking no associations, were replaced by concerts moderated by an artist who invites, hints, illuminates, ponders and doubts, asks, mediates and shares. Bernstein even laid the foundation for a demystification process of Western "classical" music by distributing the concert models to TV channels around the US. His Young People's Concerts were indisputably a significant turning point in the cultural historiography of the didactic live concert. The objective of the series was to educate young people about a defined body of knowledge, that is to say, the Western artistic repertoire. Other diverse didactic concert models were created following that example. They were constructed according to educational

¹⁸ Loretta Ho, Blair Wheaton, and Shyon Baumann, (2021). "[A life course perspective on cultural capital acquisition: How the timing and duration of musical socialization affect the taste for classical music and opera](#)," *Poetics* 84, 2021. Accessed December 5, 2022.

¹⁹ Ana Martínez, "[Fundación Juan March: Vini, Vidi, Vinci](#)," *La Tribuna de Albacete*, December 9, 2015.

²⁰ Antoine Hennion, "[Loving Music: from a Sociology of Mediation to a Pragmatics of Taste](#)," *Comunicar* xvii/34 (2010): 25–33, quote on p. 28, accessed December 7, 2022.

²¹ Lichtensztajn, "The Live Concert..."

content and pedagogical considerations; concerts were directed at adult audiences, children and families.

During the last decades, emphasis was focused on didactic concerts, as a component of the school's planned curriculum.²² We learn about the expanding phenomenon of the didactic live concert, starting in the 1990s, from a declaration of intent issued by many of the world's leading performing bodies: symphonic and chamber music orchestras in Argentina, Australia, Canada, England, Israel, New Zealand, Norway, Spain, the USA, and more.²³ In doing so, the goals of these orchestras are to expand the numbers of classical music lovers, increase the size of audiences attending live performances, and ensure their own continuing existence as performing bodies.

Discussions held during music education conferences in recent years have become a source of inspiration on the subject. That inspiration derives primarily from the fact that the process of learning-teaching music via listening tools does not fully utilize the multi-dimensional essence emerging from listening and watching a live performance. The concert models were created and edited in parallel to common outlooks, which are still widespread in music education and music teaching.

The essence of the traditional outlook, for example, is placed in the body of knowledge that lies at the center of the teaching process, where the educator is the authoritative source of information, who delivers it to the students. This established rationalistic and positivistic paradigm has become a vital source of influence; the body of knowledge earned a widely accepted, even monumental, status. The didactic concert models were woven in this context. The art of declarative, explanatory moderation surrounded the accumulating knowledge during the process. For example, the process entailed learning the characteristics of instruments: their shape and sounds, information about the composer and his period, or learning about a musical structure, such as a rondo.

Following psychological-affective concepts, active learning has been focusing on meaningful teaching. The body of knowledge is perceived as a lever in the learning process, and not as an object in itself; the individual's emotional and sensory world, activated before conceptualization or rationalization, takes part in a direct dialogue with the music, allowing the authentic experience of "knowing from within."²⁴ Active learning in music leans on the principle stating that *meaning* is the most important thing for humans. As John Dewey succinctly defined it, as early as 1910: "Learning, in the proper sense, is not learning things, but the *meanings* of things..."²⁵ Therefore, absorbing and internalizing musical characteristics of a composition is achieved by

²² Teresa Mateiro and Per Ekedhal, "Motivations and Intentions to carry out Didactic Concerts for Children," [Perspectives. Journal of the Early Childhood Music & Movement Association](#), 10/4, 2015, accessed December 6, 2022.

²³ Jan Sverre Knudsen, "['To Move, Surprise, and Thrill': Thirty Years of Promoting Cultural Diversity in Norwegian School Concerts](#)," in *The Politics of Diversity in Music education* (vol. 29 of *Landscapes: the Arts, Aesthetics, and Education*), accessed December 6, 2022.

²⁴ Anthony J. Palmer, "Multicultural Music Education: Pathways and Byways, Purpose and Serendipity," in *World Musics and Music Education: Facing the Issues*, edited by Bennett Reimer, based on a Northwestern University Leadership Seminar (Reston, VA: The National Association of Music Education, 2002), p. 44.

²⁵ John Dewey, *How We Think* (Boston: D. C. Heath & Co. Publishers, 1910), p. 176 [emphasis in the original]. See also Palmer, "Multicultural..." pp. 48–49.

activity: movement, singing or playing an instrument, as is manifested by the various music education methodologies that flourished in between the 1900s and the 1970s.²⁶

The “cognitive revolution” that followed focused on the human ability to maximize utilization of the provided educational fostering.²⁷ As a result, the hierarchy that characterized the Western conceptual superiority over the perceptual one fell apart. The new image of the human brain provided a comprehensive opportunity to develop intelligence and realize it fully. The didactic concert models were designed to align with these psychological-cognitive concepts, in which pupils actively participated. For example, by tapping a rhythmic *ostinato*, or humming a melodic fragment of a multi-vocal text; they participated in the movement describing the motions of the musical phrase or its outline; in activating a world of associations connected to extra-musical program aspects of a composition; and primarily, in attentiveness with no foreseeable outward expressions, when all the activity happens in the listener’s own internal world.

Another concept, originating in sociology, emphasizes the social context, in which the basis of empathy with the musical culture learned or performed constitutes the learning-teaching process. As such, the body of knowledge is appropriated by the receiving group, and learning becomes a two-sided dynamic process, causing changes in the body of knowledge itself. In other words, the individual listeners, with their own cultural history, rebuild and reconstruct their body of knowledge. The two groups, the teacher, lecturers and artist-performers on the one hand; and the listeners on the other, jointly reconstruct the repertoire, in a continuous process of musical evolution. The multi-cultural, post-modern ideology, which stands at the basis of this concept, favors abandoning every aesthetic interpretation in art education, due to its traditional identification with “superior” Western values, which attribute absolute aesthetic qualities to the artistic work. The term *musicality* was perceived as musically practice-dependent, as well as a defined musical culture. Instead, it now offers a multi-cultural alternative curriculum, in which the artistic “classical” music is part of all musical cultures, in a system devoid of any hierarchy.

David Elliott redefined the essence of praxis in music education and music teaching, via an array of experiments in performance-listening-improvisation-listening-arranging-listening-conducting-listening. The experiment was conducted utilizing a highly varied repertoire, entailing music of different cultures and differing styles.²⁸ According to this approach, parallel to artistic Western music concerts, didactic concerts are staged in schools by music ensembles performing a wide variety of musical genres, such as jazz, pop, rock, ethnic, electronic and folk music from around the world. There are abundant reports of concerts that represent the process of musicalization of the person studying within the learned musical frameworks.²⁹

From a glance at some cities and communities, we see that in a relatively short period, between 1998 and 2005, thousands of school students around the country streamed to concert halls, as part of semi-curricular programs intended to teach the

²⁶ For example, the methodologies of Émile-Jaques Dalcroze (1865–1950); Zoltán Kodály (1882–1967); Edgar Willems (1890–1978); Carl Orff (1895–1982); Ginette Martenot (1902–1996); and Murray Schafer (1933–2021).

²⁷ See Howard Gardner, *The Mind’s New Science: A History of the Cognitive Revolution*, (New York: Basic Books Inc. Publishers, 1985).

²⁸ David J. Elliott, “Music, Education, and Music Values,” in *Proceedings of the 21st World Conference of the International Society for Music Education on Musical Connections: Traditions and Changes*, (Tampa: ISME, 1994).

²⁹ For a wide array of descriptions and suggestions, see *Music of the World’s Cultures: A Source Book for Music Educators*, edited by Barbara Lundquist, Kati S. Szego, Bruno Nettl, Ramon Santos, and Einar Solbu, (Reading: Callaway International Resource Centre for Music Education, 1998).

repertoire that is to be performed in the school's didactic concerts, all within the music curriculum. Methodologies for preparing the school children for the concerts, continuing in-service training programs for music educators, as well as the type of repertoire performed, are all influenced by the concepts described above. Indeed, the teams leading the projects utilize a wide spectrum of approaches, starting from the design, through the preparation, development and application stages, continuing with the technical arrangements, moderation and styles of the concerts themselves, up to budgeting for and financing each of the projects.

Mediation and mediators in music education

Music is an accumulation of mediators: instruments, languages, sheets, educators, performers, scenes, media, and so on. There is no musical object in itself; music must always be made again.³⁰

The live concert is a social phenomenon, manifested through the multiple relationships between performers and audience. Recent research about the degree of communication between performers and audience indicates gaps between the expectations and goals of the main "actors" and those of the concert audience. In this context, examination of the mediation process, led by teachers, performers, and practitioners, indicates that the audience's familiarity with the repertoire does not guarantee their full enjoyment during the concert.³¹

In order to deconstruct our practices of mediation, which we seem to take for granted, two central questions emerge:

1. What *do* children hear and appreciate, rather than what *can* children hear and appreciate, through an effective culture of learning-teaching interaction in the classroom, led by teachers, performers and practitioners as mediators?
2. What artistic/human dynamics result from attending a performance? What are the social ramifications of listening to solo musicians or performing ensembles?

During some 20 years in my position as Pedagogic Director of the Keynote Program of the Israel Philharmonic Orchestra, leading educational programs of live music concerts, I have been privileged to observe and closely follow the stages of mediation that lead up to the live concert, as well as observe those for whom the mediation is directed.

The role and function of mediation and mediators in music education is drawn from Lev Vygotsky's theory of adult guidance (or collaboration with the adult), both in one-on-one and in collective teaching or tutoring situations; and from Bronfenbrenner's ecological approach of "circles" that surround the young student in an interdependent system of contexts. Both researchers emphasize that students learn through interactions with their social environment, and that such interactive and engaging activities are important for fostering children's learning-related social skills.³²

³⁰ Abstract, on [Taylor and Francis publishing group's website](#), for Antoine Hennion's *The Passion of Music: A Sociology of Mediation*, (London: Routledge, 2015).

³¹ See Hennion, "Music and Mediation..."; John Sloboda and Biranda Ford, "What Classical Musicians Can Learn from Other Arts about Building Audiences," in *Understanding Audiences: Working Paper 2*. London: Guildhall School of Music and Drama, 2011. https://slidelegend.com/sloboda-ford-working-paper-2-guildhall-school-of-music-drama_5ba62331097c470e0c8b4623.html, accessed October 9, 2022; Dochy Lichtensztajn, "Toward the Live Concert: Mediation and Mediators in Early Childhood Music Education," *Min-Ad: Israel Studies in Musicology Online* 15, no. 2 (2018).

³² See, for example, Lev Vygotsky, "The Development of Thinking and Concept Formation in Adolescence," *The Vygotsky Archive*, 1929-1931, <https://www.marxists.org/archive/vygotsky/works/1931/adolescent/ch10.htm>, accessed October 9, 2022; Urie Bronfenbrenner, *The Ecology of Human Development: Experiments by Nature and Design*. (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press,

Here the question arises as to the degree of the student's independence in learning-teaching relationships. Does the authority of knowledge still rest heavily upon the teacher's own fund of knowledge and experience, and not in children's own insights?³³ In terms of constructivist approaches, the process of mediation and mediating thinking is both something that teachers and students construct within themselves, and something that is socially constructed. The educational process requires the integration of individual cognitive processes and social processes, based on a concept of knowledge as a shared process of inquiry, while assigning it with meaning and significance. Mediating meaning, and attributing effects and values, must create an emphatic need to share feelings, to ensure the penetration of internal barriers.³⁴

In Vygotsky's educational philosophy, the connection and interaction of human rationality and the external world is reflected in the social collectivity as a qualitatively different entity from the total sum of isolated individuals.³⁵ Vygotsky also insisted that teaching should be tied more closely to the level of potential development than to the level of actual development, in his words, "the notion of a zone of proximal development enables us to propound a new formula, namely that the only 'good' learning is that which is in advance of development."³⁶ This insight—that good teaching should always help students advance to the next level of development—has been incorporated by many constructivist teachers. For Paulo Freire, problem-posing education, as opposed to the "banking concept of education," does not consist in the transfer of information, but in developing the students' consciousness or critical thinking skills. That, in turn, means that the mediator/teacher/mentor is no longer the only one who teaches, but one who also learns through the dialogue with the students. Similarly, in this model, the students take on the responsibility not only to learn but also to become co-teachers in the learning process: "Through dialogue, the teacher-of-the-students and the students-of-the-teacher cease to exist and a new term emerges: teacher-student with students-teachers."³⁷

Some considerations for the preparation process prior to the live concert

In contrast to the traditional hierarchy of music education and music instruction, and their differentiation between the theoretical vs. the applied, or the active vs. the creative fields, I consider the practice of listening attentively to live music to be a dynamic,

1979); Carol Copple and Sue Bredekamp, *Developmentally Appropriate Practice in Early Childhood: Programs Serving Children from Birth through Age 8*, (Washington, D.C.: National Association for the Education of Young Children, 1987); Ulla Härkönen, (2007), "The Bronfenbrenner Ecological Systems Theory of Human Development," *Proceedings of the V International Conference: Person. Color. Nature. Music*, (Saule, Latvia: Daugavpils University, 2008), Retrieved October 9, 2022 from <https://www.academia.edu/67678654>.

³³ See John Dewey, *The Child and the Curriculum*, (Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1902).

³⁴ Moshe Egozi and Reuven Feuerstein, *Ha-Teoria shel Ha-Lemida Ha-Metuvechet U-Mekoma BeHachsharat Morim*. [The Theory of Mediated Learning and its Position in Teachers' Training, in Hebrew], (Jerusalem: The Ministry of Education and Culture, Department of Teachers Training, 1986).

³⁵ Charlotte Hua Liu and Robert Matthews, "Vygotsky's philosophy: Constructivism and its criticisms examined," *International Education Journal*, 6, no. 3, 2005: 386-399, see p. 398.

³⁶ Lev S. Vygotsky, *Mind in Society: The Development of Higher Psychological Processes*, edited by Michael Cole, Vera John-Steiner, Sylvia Scribner, and Ellen Souberman, (Cambridge, MA: Harvard University Press, 1978). See also *Vygotsky's Educational Theory in Cultural Context*, edited by Alex Kozulin, Boris Gindis, Vladimir S. Ageyev, and Suzanne Miller, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003).

³⁷ Paulo Freire, *Pedagogy of the Oppressed*, 30th anniversary edition, translated by Myra Bergman Ramos, with an introduction by Donaldo Macedo, (New York: Continuum, 2000), p. 80.

constructive process: a creative mental process equivalent in value to music-making activities, such as performance or composing. Listening requires skills that focus on the sound's sources, remembering them and responding to them. Listening is not a natural gift that follows upon the ability to hear, but rather an acquired skill that must be honed in order to be developed. Further, listening does not happen in an isolated, atomistic instant; rather, it has a history and is reflective, which is also the ability of listening to build itself as the framework of its own activity, based on the musical events in a given piece, and on the individual or collective representation or creation of a response.³⁸

For musicians, the knowledge of musical form, that is, the structure or plan according to which a musical composition is constructed, is essential both in performance and for analysis. According to François Delalande, taxonomic listening is manifested through the listener's tendency –

- To distinguish sufficiently large morphological units, such as sections or chains, and to make a mental list of them;
- To qualify these, but just enough to distinguish them from each other;
- To notice how these units are arranged in relation to one another;
- To try and memorize all these data.³⁹

By contrast to the taxonomy for listeners with a musical background or musicians, the taxonomy for young listeners, or an adult audience without a musical background, experience, or guided listening, is anchored in their ability to absorb pieces or briefer segments of compositions. The period of becoming familiar, “making acquaintance-of/friends with” the composition, through mediation and different learning methods, entails a wide range of approaches, beginning with a vertical and more rigid approach, to one that enables dialogue and creative expression. The mental process of audition, which consists of the representation into which the aural images of music are unscrambled, is a multifaceted one.⁴⁰ Audiation is paramount in importance, because it is basic to all types of musical thinking. The question is what people do hear, rather than what people can hear, through an effective interaction between the music mediators and young children.

It is worth recalling the following aspects of the process of listening to recorded or live music:

- Perception: the ability to interpret information which our senses receive from the environment;
- Discrimination: the ability to notice, compare, and distinguish similarities and differences in sound;
- Memorization: grasping the temporal order of auditory events;
- Recognition: the ability to interpret and give meaning to the musical events.

³⁸ See John Shepherd and Kyle Devine, “Introduction: Music and the Sociological Imagination—Pasts and Presents,” in *The Routledge Reader on the Sociology of Music*, edited by John Shepherd and Kyle Devine, (New York: Routledge Press, 2015), pp. 1–21; Alcázar, Antonio Jesús Alcazar, “[La Pedagogía de la Creación Musical: Otro Enfoque de la Educación Musical](#),” *Eufonía Didáctica de la Música*.⁴⁹ (2010): 81–92, accessed on October 10, 2022.

³⁹ Lasse Thoresen, “Form-Building Transformations: An Approach to the Aural Analysis of Emergent Musical Forms,” *The Journal of Music and Meaning* 4, (2007); Miriam Hlavatý, “[Listening Intentions. Part I. It is all about attitude](#)” (personal blog, 2018), accessed December 7, 2022.

⁴⁰ Lili M. Levinowitz, “The Importance of Music in Early Childhood,” *General Music Today*, 12 no. 1 (1998): 4–7.

An absolute majority (95%) of non-musician listeners chose instrumentation/timbre over melody and harmonic accompaniment as the salient cue for recognition, while musicians always chose melody and harmonic accompaniment over instrumentation.⁴¹ These findings indicate that non-musicians do not share, or perhaps do not use, the same cognitive schemata as those used by musicians. In light of these data, the process of mediated listening includes different versions of the same musical piece (live performance or recorded instrumental piece), unaccompanied (voice only) and accompanied (voice and instrumental accompaniment) song, identical melodies played with different instrumentation, and melodies varying in harmonization, instrumentation, and requiring discrimination of simultaneous melodies.⁴² The different versions of the same composition enable young listeners to perceive, distinguish, and focus on certain aspects of music, while at the same time selecting and filtering out “irrelevant” information, as well as to perceive simultaneous events as independent parts of a whole.⁴³ This process addresses aural skills, aesthetic and emotional reactions, different networks of association that form a part of mental processing, an experiential level of fantasy, and taste, as “the overall patterning of an individual’s preferences.”⁴⁴

The Israel Philharmonic Orchestra *Keynote* Program for music education and community outreach

The Israel Philharmonic’s *Keynote* Program was initiated by the orchestra in 2000. The pianist Irit Rub was appointed as the program’s Executive Director; I joined later, as the Pedagogical Director. Since then, we have been working together to introduce children, adolescents and college students to music, by exposing them to live music, through encounters with small ensembles of the IPO and orchestral concerts in concert halls. From the IPO reaches out to young audiences, from kindergartens through colleges and universities, through personal sessions in the classroom, and through especially produced concerts for schools at the Charles Bronfman Auditorium in Tel Aviv. The program serves all Israeli residents: Jews, Christians, Muslims, immigrant children of foreign workers, religious and secular schools and institutions.

The Program’s principal aim is to introduce the students to the world of “live” concerts, offering a musical repertoire that goes beyond styles and cultures. Moreover, *Keynote* aims to enable an accumulative, meaningful, human collective experience, where music and orchestra become a common asset that unites the listeners during the concerts. This asset is rarely shared between schools, which are separated by status; ethnic-cultural; religious; national and political divisions.

Keynote’s goals were drawn up after a thoughtful and careful planning process. Flexibility was built in from the very beginning; the program is open to changes based

⁴¹ Rita S. Wolpert, “Recognition of Melody, Harmonic Accompaniment, and Instrumentation: Musicians vs. Non musicians,” *Music Perception* 8, no. 1, (1990): 95–105.

⁴² *Ibid.*; see also Lichtensztajn “Toward the Live Concert...”

⁴³ Robert G. Crowder, Mary L. Serafine, and Bruno Repp, “Physical Interaction and Association by Contiguity in Memory for the Words and Melodies of Songs,” *Memory & Cognition* 18, no. 5, (1990): 469–76; Beatriz Ilari and Megha Sundara, “Music Listening Preferences in Early Life: Infants’ Responses to Accompanied Versus Unaccompanied Singing,” *Journal of Research in Music Education* 56, No. 4 (2009): 357–69.

⁴⁴ David J. Hargreaves and Adrian C. North, “Experimental aesthetics and liking for music,” in *Handbook of Music and Emotion: Theory, Research, Applications*, edited by Patrik N. Juslin and John A. Sloboda, (Oxford: Oxford University Press, 2010), 515–546, p. 518.

on continuous feedback from all participants—performers, teachers and audiences—and from studies conducted since its establishment. These goals are:

- To create a receptive audience of sensitive music lovers and potential performers, developing them as future audience for music in particular and for the performing arts in general;
- To enable and facilitate personal, direct meetings between performers and younger audiences in smaller spaces, such as in school;
- To develop a sense of empathy and identification with the performers (mediators between the students and the world of music), sparking the idea that “someday I, too, will be able to play and sing”;
- To be part of a heterogeneous community, as they, young students and particularly kindergarteners, experience a consolidating act: sitting together in the civic auditorium and actively listening to a shared repertoire they have acquired, facilitating the creation of a collective memory during and after experiencing the concert.⁴⁵

To achieve these goals, a multi-year program was developed. It includes mediated concerts presenting the various styles and periods of the symphonic repertoire, which is distributed ahead of time to music teachers around the country. Concurrently with the teaching of the chosen repertoire in music classes, a series of preparatory meetings between students and small ensembles from the IPO take place; the performers primarily play arrangements of the pieces that are to be performed in every symphonic concert. These preparatory meetings with the students, mediated by the Keynote staff of mediators (who are themselves musicians and music educators, mostly alumni of the Levinsky Faculty of Music Education), provide a continuous intertwining of content and teaching strategies, and are scheduled as part of the regular music lessons. The goals of these personal meetings are:

- To summon natural, transparent human behavior with the potential of creating a controlled dialogue, feelings of empathy and even identification with the performing artists, who themselves come from various origins and backgrounds;
- To clearly demonstrate musical phenomena, like texture, the process of retrieving each part from it, or the tonal nuances, the harmonies and articulations;
- To enable the perception of playing together, addressing technical aspects of music as well as its expressive ones.

“East-West and Within Our Space”

The preparatory meetings highlight and enlighten what was learned in class, heralding the symphonic concert as the zenith in an artistic, as well as human, process. Above all, the personal meeting between Israeli Jewish and Arab performing artists, with students of different cultural backgrounds, is in and of itself a model of dialogue through live music. Such a human-artistic scenario, for example, is emphasized in a concert program

⁴⁵ See also Dochy Lichtensztajn, “Live Music Encounters—The *Kadma* Program and its Ideological Implications in a Process of Co-existence and Tolerance,” [*Proceeding of the 29th World Conference of the International Society for Music Education*](#), [ISME], Beijing, China, August 1, 2010, pp. 124–28, accessed December 7, 2022.

that takes place every three years, when a new cohort of students participate in the program for the first time. The specific repertoire serves as a potential model, functioning as a bridge between fractured populations. The concert program “East-West and Within Our Space,” designed for third through sixth graders, integrated Western cultural exoticism (works such as *Scheherazade* by Nikolai Rimsky-Korsakov or *The Bacchanalia Dance* by Camille Saint-Saëns; Hebrew Middle-Eastern style compositions by Jewish composers as Alexander Boskovich; Arab compositions by Farid al-Atrash and Salim El-Masri; all interwoven with centuries-old Persian folk songs, that were transmitted through generations of both Jewish and Muslim populations. In addition to members of the Israel Philharmonic Orchestra, the Jewish-Arab ensemble Shesh-Besh, which was founded almost simultaneously with *Keynote*, performed at the concert.

Questions and dilemmas touch on universal issues in music, music perception and cognition, learned and natural musical schemata. As Prof. Dalia Carmi-Cohen, a pioneering musicologist at the Hebrew University and the Jerusalem Academy of Music and Dance phrased in her research:

How is culture involved in shaping a musical tradition? What experiences are afforded by different styles? Are there universal principles beyond culture, that play a role in shaping our musical experience (universality is expressed primarily in the relationship between organizational principles and aesthetic ideal)? What guides the choice of a set of organizational rules for a particular style (polyphonic vs. monophonic, melismatic vs. syllabic, etc.)? What may be considered “different,” and what “similar”? [What are] ways in which music “flows” in time; momentary complexity versus overall complexity?⁴⁶

And most important: If East and West both “different” and “similar,” and given that Israel is home to a multiplicity of musical traditions and all types of blending of these traditions, could the live concert serve as a medium for communication and a means for promoting social connectedness, along with other musical formats? As mentioned above, the repertoire, which is learned in the ongoing music lessons in school, serves as the focus for recognizing the various components of music (those that are manifest and those less obvious), the genres and types of music, and their cultural characteristics.

The Music Teachers and the *Keynote* Program

The mediators who introduce this music to the new listeners are the music teachers, who themselves have their own thoughts, feelings and associations; they carry their own cultural baggage, for music in general, and sometimes regarding a particular composition. Such factors influence the way in which the repertoire is introduced, perceived and absorbed, first and foremost among the music teacher population itself. Indeed, during the first decade of the *Keynote* Program for primary schools, over thirty music educators from different socio-economic and cultural backgrounds have been meeting regularly within the teacher enrichment programs that trained them to teach the *Keynote* repertoires in class.

⁴⁶ דליה כרמי-כהן, “מוסיקה בתרבויות שונות: המשותף והמפריד ביניהן,” סגנוניות ורב תרבותיות במוסיקה ובמחול, 28–9. עמ' 9–28. Dalia Carmi-Cohen, “Music in Different Cultures: Shared and Divergent Features” in *Music in Time: Multi-Culture, Synthesis and Collaboration*, Jerusalem: The Jerusalem Academy of Music and Dance, 2007, pp. 9–28. In Hebrew, translation mine, quotation from p. 9.

The three preliminary stages of the symphonic concerts—(1) preparing the program’s musical repertoire for each semester; (2) the teaching and enrichment programs for music teachers, and (3) the personal chamber music meetings at school, (with ensembles of players from the Philharmonic and the from the Shesh-Besh Jewish-Arab ensemble)—all are aimed to invigorate and ensure the collective pleasure of the actual performance.

The children attending the concerts are accompanied by their general teachers and other school staff. In 2006, after considerable thought and discussions about ways to bring the general educational staff of schools that participate in the *Keynote* program closer to the live concert, we initiated meetings with those schools’ principals and general teachers. These meetings were held toward an innovation of the program: bringing teachers, most of whom are in their late twenties to late forties, to attend a regular IPO subscription concert. The meetings with the educational staffs roughly matched those we held with students in the Keynote Program. They entailed a short explanation of the repertoire that would be played, and personal meeting with the conductor and members of the orchestra, who shared their stories about their own audition, their professional lives, and their hopes that their music will elicit emotional reactions of the audience. At the end of the pre-concert meeting and a tour of Philharmonic Hall, the teachers and principals joined the regular concert audience. For most of them, this was the first time they had ever attended, as adults, a classical music concert. The preparation meeting and explanations contributed significantly to reduce their anxiety and stress, which, according to many of their own reports, they have been feeling until the moment the conductor raised his baton and the orchestra’s first notes were heard.

Based on the idea that the Live Music Encounters community project also promotes the development of music teachers’ skills, which are transferable from the context of schools to those of live concert models, the Keynote Program, in partnership with the Levinsky Faculty of Music Education, promotes a unique course of strategies for concerts mediation. The theoretical lessons and workshops aim to enrich the toolbox of concert-mediation skills and techniques of the participants—a mix of music teachers, students of music education, and performing artists.⁴⁷ During the course, interesting and gradually more open and tolerant interactions occurred between the different groups involved, each of which was accustomed to its own traditional methods of working, learning and teaching:

- The music educators, who regularly teach the concerts’ repertoire in schools or kindergartens;
- The music educators-in-training;
- The performing artists (musicians, singers and conductors) who appear in mini-concerts in educational institutions, and later in symphonic or chamber concerts in the communal auditorium;
- The leaders-coordinators who conduct and animate the chamber meetings in classrooms.

The course, named “Designing, Presenting, Moderating and Animating Concerts” triggered an interesting discussion between my colleagues, the guest lecturers. These are distinguished performers, who had had great and successful experiences in hosting

⁴⁷ Dochy Lichtensztajn, “The Live Music Encounters: An Integrate Vision of Leadership, Good Teaching and Facilitation Practice,” in *CMA XI: Projects, Perspectives, and Conversations*, Edited by Don D. Coffman, (Rome, 2008), pp. 202–216.

concerts for children, teenagers and adults. However, never before had they been asked to conceptualize and lecture on the discipline of music from a theoretical perspective: rationale, principles, criteria, objectives and implementation. This discussion yielded important outcomes for everyone involved: the participants learning, and the lecturers who are both teaching and studying a new discipline.⁴⁸ In the course, the various aspects of guided concerts in schools are addressed in theoretical lessons, workshops, and especially in the structured observation of concerts performed for students of different ages and various social and cultural backgrounds. After a guided attendance at a concert, the discussion with the students serves as a perfect opportunity for a reflective and critical application of what they had learned in the course meetings. The discussion may cover, for example, the choice of repertoire; the integrative design of the concert program and its organizing principle, as derived from the objectives; the style and function of narration or explanations, such as “informative,” “analytical,” or “interdisciplinary” guidance; covert or overt explanations; narration that foreshadows, summarizes, alludes, or creates tension through leading questions, and so on. Other topics of interest can include the degree of audience participation and the interactions between performing ensemble and moderator.

This one-year academic course was offered for five years by the Levinsky College Faculty of Music Education. Most of the course’s alumni are among the best moderators of the Keynote Program and of other programs that utilize aspects of the Keynote model. In 2020, the Keynote Program updated the course’s contents, emphasizing community as the primary focus of the live concert. A principal attribute of the new approach is that the emphasis on cooperation is manifest in a new partnership between the Keynote Program, the Buchmann-Mehta School of Music at Tel-Aviv University, and the Ministry of Education. The partnership between the IPO and Tel-Aviv University in establishing and supervising the Buchmann-Mehta School of Music has yielded interesting initiatives by the course’s participants, who have shaped up and expanded its principles in music education programs in Israel’s urban center and its periphery.

The performer and the audience: the concert as a social and artistic challenge

In his article about music and performance, Nicholas Cook quotes Christopher Small: “Music is not a thing but an activity. Something that people do.”⁴⁹ He also develops Small’s argumentation, stating that “Western classical music embodies a kind of society that does not allow for mutual participation of all peoples because it is based upon works, not interactions,” and that “in a more inclusive and creative society there shall be ‘no such thing as a musical work, in which there are only the activities of singing, playing, listening—and most probably, dancing.’”⁵⁰

Considering the process of becoming acquainted with the repertoire in the context of the varying perception, memory, and interpretation abilities at the different stages of children’s development, the crucial test of enjoyment lies in maximizing the nonverbal communication dynamics between the performers and the audience at the live concert. Furthermore, the transition from the school environment to the auditorium situates the individual child as an anonymous listener within an audience of about 300–1000 participants. In such an environment, the visual aspects of the performance

⁴⁸ Ibid.

⁴⁹ Nicholas Cook, “[Between Process and Product: Music and/as Performance](#),” *Music Theory Only* 7/2, April 2001, p. 2, quoting Christopher Small’s *Musicking: The Meanings of Performing and Listening*, (Middletown, CT: Wesleyan University Press, 1998), p. 2.

⁵⁰ Nicholas Cook, Ibid. Small’s quote is from *Musicking*, p. 11.

personalize the music, drawing performers and listeners closer together in a shared experience. This array of expectations and considerations regarding the concert's success among its listeners places the concert scene at the apex of mediation complexity: being touched by this piece in the here and now, in a collective recreation of a musical composition and its communication.

Music is a social phenomenon, and as much as we want to, we cannot let music be just music. Music teachers come face to face with their students' musical likes and dislikes of every day. Bourdieu helps us to deepen our understanding of musical upbringing and socialization through the concept of *habitus*, identity formation and likes/dislikes that are at the basis of these distinctions and perceptions. It is therefore worthwhile to circle around and re-examine how the performer and the audience create together the experience of the classical concert. Recent research about the degree of communication between the performers and the listening audience indicates gaps between the expectations and goals of the main actors at the concert.⁵¹ The performers' approach reflects particularly high-quality playing, as well as maximal and successful coordination. Performers regard sound and the coordination of sound as the most important element of communication. The dominance of the audio element in inter-performer communication means that auditory information is prioritized over the visual in terms of synchronization among performers when playing pieces without significant temporal changes.⁵² On the other hand, orchestral musicians have described a lack of creativity in their work when required "to produce unspectacular but efficient performances day after day, night after night."⁵³ John Sloboda and Biranda Ford argue that classical musicians are not focused on audiences:

The audience is not the most important issue in classical music. Rather, it is the work. So far, we've mainly considered the relationship between the performer and the audience, but more important than that to classical music is another relationship, namely the performers' relationship, or sense of duty if you like, to the composer and the work.

[...]

Both performer and audiences came to concerts primarily, not to have a relationship with each other but to realize a relationship with the composer and his great works. The performer became a medium, the conduit for the voice of the composer. Even today, performers are said to have given good performances if they have effaced themselves and brought out the composer's intentions.⁵⁴

Forming a habitus of conduct during concert performance.

After the personal encounter with IPO musicians in kindergarten or school environments, the children experience the concluding symphonic concert at the auditorium. Which visual and aural characteristics emerge from the musicians on stage? Considering the young listeners' recognition stage, and their sense of familiarity with the repertoire, we may see some perception of sameness and difference; the young

⁵¹ See Sloboda and Ford, "What Classical Musicians Can Learn..."

⁵² Bruno H. Repp and Amandine Penel, "[Auditory Dominance in Temporal Processing: New Evidence from Synchronization with Simultaneous Visual and Auditory Sequences](#)," *Journal of Experimental Psychology: Human Perception and Performance* 28, no. 5, (2002):1085–99, accessed December 7, 2022.

⁵³ Stephen Cottrell, *Professional Music Making in London: ethnography and Experience*. (London: Ashgate, 2004), p. 114.

⁵⁴ Sloboda and Ford, "What Classical Musicians Can Learn...", p.7.

listeners may also be meaningfully categorizing the various elements and environments represented by the repertoire. Being familiar with the repertoire, however, does not guarantee full enjoyment during the concert. This audience of listeners has high expectations concerning the performers' physical presences: their body movements, hand gestures, their attitudes toward the audience, their facial expressions, their way of sitting or standing on stage, and, of course, the way they are dressed. The pianist Stephen Hough, in an interview with Carlos Gardels, said:

I think it's terribly important for musicians to have silence in their lives because we're dealing constantly with something that breaks the silence; music is sound waves which interrupt the silence, therefore for musicians, silence is the soil into which we have to plant music; we must nourish the soil, make sure it's of good quality so that our seeds will take root.⁵⁵

Unhabituated to the Western concert ritual of complete silence in the audience, and in spite of it being a prerequisite at the Program's preparation stage, my experience is that when the audience is thoroughly familiar with the repertoire, having been introduced to it and heard it a number of times in their classes, they manifest a wide variety of reactions:

- A sense of wonder and thrill by the auditory and sensory stimuli, and a strong urge to express their impressions by sharing them in whispers with their mates;
- This strong urge (and the ensuing whispering) reappear, once they identify the performed composition as familiar;
- When the orchestra's performance is too different from the version they heard in class (usually from a recording), some tend to cover their ears...

Interestingly, the teachers and parents accompanying the students also react by whispering, due to their strong, initial impressions of the sounds generated by the orchestra. Both the youngsters and the adults whisper, keeping their voices quiet in consideration of the orchestra and other members of the audience, albeit quite unable to keep complete silence. Like every other socio-cultural ritual, however, the "complete silence codes" are internalized over time, as if an unwritten contract exists between the performers and the listeners, a process that occurs only if the concerts are not just fleeting, rare episodes, but continuous annual events, as part of a process of learning and reinforcing what is learned. In other words, the listeners undergo an educational process of musical socialization, from childhood to adulthood. In Bourdieu's terms, this is *habitus* formation, the "matrix of perceptions, appreciations, and actions."⁵⁶

Both quantitative and qualitative studies have been conducted on the Keynote Program since its inception. The research focused on assessing pedagogical strategies and student experiences as a means of deriving the Program's educational and cultural impact. We proposed a new angle of research for the 2020–2021 season, to examine aspects of music teachers' leadership within school contexts. Our study aimed to trace efforts to expand and deepen the resonance of the Keynote Program within the participating educational institutions. By focusing on the music teachers' efforts to

⁵⁵ Carlos Gardels, "[Why Musicians Need Silence in an Always-Connected World](#)," *Huff Post*, April 7, 2016, accessed December 7, 2022.

⁵⁶ Pierre Bourdieu, *Outline of a Theory of Practice*, [1972] translated by Richard Nice, (Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1977), p. 83.

enlarge the impact of the Keynote experience to include fellow teachers and school administrators, we wanted to explore the Program's effect on the professional status of school music teachers, and that of music education as a school subject. For the purpose of this study, we chose an Action Research paradigm developed by Amira Ehrlich (2019- 2020).⁵⁷ Two teacher-researchers who has participated in the Keynote program for several years conducted the study; they worked with a number of schools in the center of Israel, in which students from first to sixth grades participate in the Keynote program. The researchers examined the music teachers' efforts to involve new entities during the music education process they conduct. The study was based on documents submitted by the teachers, and on discussions held with the music teachers, homeroom teachers, and teachers of other subjects in the schools, and the researchers. The study examined the music teachers' shared experiences to lead change in the school's human status, and in its mechanisms, by encouraging the involvement of new pedagogic-music entities. The aforementioned efforts made by the teachers were attended by the research team, helping to systematically build the circles of the active study, which included:

- an early identification of discomfort in the school concerning the music teacher's status, and that of the Keynote Program;
- planning activities, the purpose of which was to lead into change by expanding the involvement of new entities in the Program, its events and activities;
- documenting the steps taken and the activities that took place.
- analysis of the activities and reflection on the process.

Personal stories: two teachers

Ilana is a school teacher, involved with the teachers' course of the Keynote Program. During the period in which the study was conducted, Ilana emphasized expanding her work within the Keynote Program from its focus on listening to a focus on *doing*. During the small-scale meetings with members of the Philharmonic in the classrooms, the students and musicians played together. Ilana wrote arrangements of the compositions that would be performed in the concerts; the parts were simple, mostly written for xylophones, and some for specific students who could play other instruments. "Think how powerful it is," said Ilana, "when a student who was used to sitting and listening to musicians, suddenly meets them on a different ground, and plays some of the pieces together with them!"⁵⁸

Other teachers who participated in the study perceived their intervention not as a source of enjoyment and success but, actually, as a source of discomfort, which they themselves experienced in the Program. While discussing this feeling of discomfort, there was an overwhelming agreement that the principal difficulty in operating the Keynote Program lies with the need to maintain good relations with all intricate network of partners and administrators in the schools. These relationships can be described as a series of concentric circles. The first and closest circle consists of the music teachers and the rest of the school's educational staff: general teachers and principals. The second circle includes the music teachers—from various schools—who train together throughout the year, and develop relationships with each other while teaching the same or similar material in their respective schools. The third, "inner

⁵⁷ Amira Ehrlich, "Keynote Program: Action Research," (Tel Aviv: The Israeli Philharmonic Orchestra, 2019–2020).

⁵⁸ Ibid.

circle,” involves the most intensive relations, between the teachers and their own students. Like Ilana, Ronit is a music teacher at a school, but she does feel frustrated:

I invite the homeroom teacher to be in the class before the musicians arrive, and of course I invite her when they come in. Unfortunately, the homeroom teachers prefer to use that window as free time, allowing her to have a relaxed cup of coffee in the teachers’ lounge.

Ronit decided to take action, and as part of the study identified the teachers’ lounge as a target: “Not just the homeroom teachers. I want to reach the entire crowd in the teachers’ lounge.” The main challenge, holding a special preparatory session for a group of teachers attending the concert at the Culture Center, is that such a session requires each teacher to pay a small, symbolic sum.⁵⁹ As part of the study, Ronit targeted the teachers’ lounge: “Not only the homeroom teachers; I want to involve everyone [there].” In effect, she wanted to implement an idea that was already part of the Keynote Program, called The Teachers’ Lounge Hosts. It consisted of a “package” directed to teachers—general and professional—who are not music teachers. The package includes:

- a two-hour pre-concert meeting in one of the concert hall’s practice rooms. During the meeting the teachers listen to a short explanation about the compositions they are about to hear;
- they meet with the conductor or with a guest soloist;
- they meet with two members of the orchestra, who play the motifs of the music they will hear, and talk about what it is like to be a member of the Philharmonic Orchestra;
- they sit in a very good seat in the concert hall for a regular performance of the Philharmonic Orchestra.

The cost of the package is heavily subsidized, but in many cases the teachers have to pay a small fee to participate. This has proven to be an obstacle to the implementation of the Teacher Lounge Hosts option of the Keynote Program.⁶⁰

The fee contribution issue arose during the discussions with the teachers at the course. It turned out that several of the schools’ administrators agreed to cover the costs, while others left it for the teachers to cover. In this context, Ronit’s success was especially impressive: the teachers in her school all paid for their concert tickets. In an effort to understand how Ronit managed to get a group of almost ten teachers to attend the pre-concert meeting, she explained that the problem with the homeroom teachers (in fact, with all the non-music teachers) is that they do not experience the same process as their students. Most of the general teachers are culturally unacquainted with Western symphonic music, and would prefer to hear popular singers. She held a Teachers’ Lounge Hosts meeting with ten teachers (not necessarily homeroom teachers) from her school. They participated in the preparatory meeting, in which they met the conductor and some of the musicians immediately before the concert, and then went to the concert, and paid for their tickets. Ronit described the satisfaction from her success: “from my point of view, if I managed to bring a significant group of teachers who can have this experience, I’ve succeeded.”⁶¹

⁵⁹ Ibid.

⁶⁰ Ibid.

⁶¹ Ibid.

The Keynote Program live music encounters: assumptions and the establishment

The pluralistic concept, supposedly characteristic of an open, democratic society, is committed to a planned application of its principles in the field of educational and cultural policy. Among them are didactic concert projects like the Keynote Program, both in their original regions and forms, and others, using different models around the country. The tendency to try improve and expand the Keynote Program, and the aim of implementing them in a controlled and gradual manner in other regions does not, at present, receive support from the national government. It should be stated that, as for now, the subject of music is not among the compulsory subjects that comprise the core curriculum in Israeli schools. Moreover, there is a severe shortage of music teachers, leading to an acute reduction in the number of schools that participate in concert programs like the Keynote Program. The paucity of music teachers is even more apparent in secondary schools; normally, music is not taught after elementary school, except for at a handful of schools that offer a major in music. Further, according to my observation, even in the elementary schools most music teachers work with the youngest classes. Unfortunately, the Ministry of Education has not published any statistics on teaching staff in music education for whole classes (except for one-on-one instrumental lessons) in elementary schools. Based on the concept that a school is a learning community in all aspects, this situation raises several questions:

- Can we “create” a desire, a *need* for live concerts among young children?
- Should we adhere to the fundamentals of the process as it was planned and created, requiring age-appropriate musical events provided to students at a relatively high frequency, so that they become an integral part of the community’s cultural experience?
- Or should we be satisfied (as many local councils already do) with a minimal exposure to live concerts, experienced by the children only once during the six years of elementary education?

These questions reflect the present crossroads regarding the didactic concert: will it be a transient episode in the historiography of Israeli music education, or a continuous and continuing educational experience? A close examination of the prevailing institutional practices, measured by quantitative achievements, is badly needed. Institutions that reach the required bench mark should be substantially supported rewarded. For that, a commitment to a long-term process is needed.

While the didactic live concert can bring about a positive change in the long-term *musicalization* of the school community. For that, certain conditions are necessary, such as the re-introduction of music as a compulsory part of the core curriculum, providing each and every elementary school with age-appropriate, at least weekly music lessons, as a manifestation of the subject’s status and its goals, and ensuring an sufficient supply of well-trained and appropriately compensated professional classroom music teachers. This will allow for the multi-year, multi-cycle Keynote Program to continue developing and creating a community dialogue, whereby thousands of students enter the concert hall for a musical experience, participating in the human and artistic collage of listening to live music and sharing the intellectual and emotional experience that the live concert provides. The road will then be paved for the live concert to evoke an inspiring and energizing artistic performance, which the young listeners will receive with renewed interpretations and joy.